Animal Communication Theory

The explanation of animal communication by means of concepts such as information, meaning and reference is one of the central foundational issues in animal behaviour studies. This book explores these issues, revolving around questions such as:

- What is the nature of information?
- What theoretical roles does information play in animal communication studies?
- Is it justified to employ these concepts in order to explain animal communication?
- What is the relation between animal signals and human language?

The book approaches the topic from a variety of disciplinary perspectives, including ethology, animal cognition, theoretical biology and evolutionary biology, as well as philosophy of biology and mind. A comprehensive introduction familiarises non-specialists with the field and leads on to chapters ranging from philosophical and theoretical analyses to case studies involving primates, birds and insects. The resulting survey of new and established concepts and methodologies will guide future empirical and theoretical research.

ULRICH STEGMANN is a Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen. After training initially as a biologist, he subsequently switched to philosophy and now specialises in Philosophy of Biology. He was awarded a British Academy Postdoctoral Research Fellowship and has previously worked at the Universities of Cambridge and Bristol.
Animal Communication Theory
Information and Influence

Edited by

Ulrich Stegmann
University of Aberdeen
Contents

Preface page ix
List of contributors xiii

Introduction: A primer on information and influence in animal communication 1
Ulrich E. Stegmann

Part I Varieties of information 41

1 Influence and information in communication networks 43
   Andrew G. Horn and Peter McGregor

2 Animal communication as information-mediated influence 63
   Andrea Scarantino

3 Communication as information use: insights from statistical decision theory 89
   Caitlin R. Kight, John M. McNamara, David W. Stephens and Sasha R. X. Dael

4 Communication as a transfer of information: measurement, mechanism and meaning 113
   R. Haven Wiley

5 Natural information, intentional signs and animal communication 133
   Ruth G. Millikan
vi Contents

**Part II Influence and manipulation** 149

6 Communication without meaning or information: abandoning language-based and informational constructs in animal communication 151  
**Drew Rendall and Michael J. Owren**

7 Information in animal communication: when and why does it matter? 189  
**Sahotra Sarkar**

8 Mitogenetic rays and the information metaphor: transmitted information has seen its day 207  
**Eugene S. Morton and Richard G. Coss**

9 The importance of integrative biology to sexual selection and communication 233  
**Michael J. Ryan**

**Part III Case studies** 257

10 Animal signals: always influence, sometimes information 259  
**Claire Horisk and Reginald B. Cocroft**

11 Learned signals and consistency of delivery: a case against receiver manipulation in animal communication 281  
**Carlos A. Botero and Selvino R. de Kort**

12 Information, inference and meaning in primate vocal behaviour 297  
**Julia Fischer**

13 Information and uncertainty in meerkats and monkeys 319  
**Colin Allen**

14 The neural representation of vocalisation perception 337  
**Kate L. Christison-Lagay and Yale E. Cohen**

**Part IV Animal signals in evolutionary perspective** 355

15 The value of information in biology 357  
**Michael Lachmann**
Contents vii

16 Information and influence in sender–receiver models, with applications to animal behaviour 377
Peter Godfrey-Smith

Part V From animal signals to human language 397

17 Information, meaning and animal communication 399
Fred Adams and Steve Beighley

18 Information, influence and inference in language evolution 421
Thomas C. Scott-Phillips and Simon Kirby

Index 443
Preface

Central to the notion of communication is the reception of information through a stimulus that an organism perceives from the external environment.

Peter Marler (1967)

[W]e prefer to avoid the very idea of information, whether true information or false. [...] [T]he traditional views of the functions of communications – transmission of information as to species, sex, breeding condition, etc. – are pitifully inadequate to account for the musical elaboration of bird song. [...] Oratory is unnecessary if the purpose is simply to convey information.

Richard Dawkins and John Krebs (1978, pp. 304 and 308)

This book is about a familiar view in animal behaviour studies: the idea that animal communication is a matter of conveying information. On this view, interacting animals are construed as senders, who emit signals that carry information, and receivers, who pick up the information in order to guide their behaviour. Communication systems as diverse as the waggle dance of honeybees, the alarm calls of vervet monkeys and the light pulses of fireflies are all regarded as sharing the same basic means of regulating behaviour. That is, animals respond to signals in certain ways because the signals carry useful information: worker bees fly to a particular location because the dance informed them about the whereabouts of a valuable resource, vervet monkeys hide in a bush because the alarm call signalled an approaching eagle, and so on. This is the view that Peter Marler’s remark encapsulates so well. But it has not gone unchallenged. Some 30 years ago, Richard Dawkins and John Krebs suggested banishing the information concept from the study of animal communication. Since then there have been occasional calls for replacing, or at least supplementing, information with concepts such as manipulation and influence.
One motivation was the thought that information is, at bottom, merely an empty metaphor, and a harmful one at that. More recently, when the preparations for this volume were already under way, this lingering tension came to the fore and attracted wider attention.

The criticisms of the information view raise some fundamental questions about the study and nature of animal communication. How are concepts such as ‘information’ and ‘meaning’ employed? Which theoretical roles are they meant to play? Do they live up to these roles? Do they adequately conceptualise animal communication and, if so, to what extent and why? And ultimately: what do information, reference and meaning consist in? Do these phenomena feature in interactions between animals? Similar questions can be asked of the purported alternatives: manipulation, persuasion and influence.

The goal of this volume is to address these issues head-on and, more broadly, to improve our understanding of the conceptual and methodological foundations of animal behaviour studies. The volume aims to achieve this goal in several ways. First, it brings together key proponents and opponents of the informational approach, offering an opportunity to engage directly with the arguments, for example by means of peer commentaries to individual chapters. Second, it broadens the way in which the topic is addressed by considering advances in related fields, such as the neuroscience of signal processing, signal evolution, the relation between animal signals and human language, and statistical decision theory. Third, it adds a philosophical point of view. Inviting philosophers to the table may strike many practitioners as a risky move. The concern may be that it blows out of proportion moderate, and as some believe insignificant, disagreements, engulfing the topic in unproductive sophistry. However, I believe that philosophy has specific and valuable resources to offer. Theories of information, for instance, can help articulate what information is, or plausibly could be, and what role it might play in animal communication.

A few remarks about the structure of this book. The introduction is intended for readers who are new to the topic. It surveys informational and non-informational approaches to animal communication and sketches some philosophical concepts and distinctions. The 18 chapters are divided into five parts.

Part I explores the key notion of information. Horn and McGregor use the perspective of communication networks to operationalise information. Scarantino defends a probabilistic theory of information and applies it to animal communication. Kight, McNamara, Stephens and Dall recommend the use of statistical decision theory in order to understand signalling. Wiley defends both qualitative and quantitative notions of information. Millikan advances a solution to the reference problem for probabilistic theories of information.
Part II subjects the information concept to criticism and advocates alternative approaches. Rendall and Owren bolster and extend their previous criticisms with doubts about current views of human language and communication. Sarkar challenges the utility of both qualitative and quantitative notions of information in explaining animal signalling. Morton and Coss, and the late Professor Owings, argue that information is an empty metaphor, best replaced with a ‘management’ approach. Ryan focuses on sexual communication to argue that informational explanations are impoverished.

Part III addresses the topic from the point of view of specific case studies, which range from insects and birds to meerkats and monkeys. Horisk and Cocroft consider vibrational communication in treehoppers and conclude that information transfer is optional. Botero and de Kort argue that manipulation cannot adequately explain song consistency in birds. Fischer explores the attractions and limits of understanding primate vocal communication in terms of information. Allen uses work on meerkats to defend the informational approach. Christison-Lagay and Cohen review how primates process the vocalisations of conspecifics at the neural level and stress the activation of multiple brain areas.

Part IV provides an evolutionary perspective on animal signalling. Lachmann ties quantitative information measures to fitness consequences. Godfrey-Smith explores the properties of sender–receiver systems at equilibrium and concludes that information and influence are complementary.

Part V explores the relation between animal signals and human language. Adams and Beighley regard animal communication as a matter of information transfer and reserve meaning for human languages. With a view on evolutionary linguistics, Scott-Phillips and Kirby propose an inferential model of communication that revolves around influence as its basic component.

The idea for this volume was hatched in 2008. It was part of a grant application to the British Academy for a project on informational and non-informational approaches to animal communication (SG-51996). I gratefully acknowledge the Academy’s support. It allowed me, among other things, to visit Carel ten Cate, Rufus Johnstone and Nick Davies, and to hold conversations with Eugene Morton, Donald Owings, Michael Owren, Drew Rendall and Klaus Zuberbühler. Their patience and openness greatly helped me to better understand animal communication and prepare this book, for which I am very thankful. I would also like to thank the authors of this volume for their willingness to participate in a joint project, about which some have strong views, and to expose their chapters to open peer commentary. The external reviewers provided invaluable and constructive feedback on the individual chapters. For this I am indebted to Dorit Bar-On, Michael D. Beecher, Carl T. Bergstrom,
Preface

Guiseppe Boncoraglio, Jack W. Bradbury, Gordon M. Burghardt, Matthew Campbell, Rosa Cao, Erica A. Cartmill, Sarah Collins, Torben Dabelsteen, Hilmi Demir, Stephen M. Downes, Simon Fitzpatrick, Patrick Forber, Todd Freeberg, T. Ulmar Grafe, Justin Garson, Steven Hamblin, Anne Leonard, Ola Olsson, Jessica Pfeifer, Carolyn Price, Rafael L. Rodriguez, Gregg Recanzone, William A. Searcy, Nicholas Shea, Andrew D. M. Smith, Mitchell Steinschneider, Robert M. Seyfarth, Brandon C. Wheeler, and three reviewers who preferred to remain anonymous. Special thanks are owed to Jack Bradbury, who provided extensive comments on a range of issues, especially statistical decision theory, and gave valuable advice in preparing this volume. I am also very grateful to Robert Seyfarth for sharing, despite some reservations, his immensely constructive advice. Any remaining shortcomings are, of course, my responsibility. I thank my colleague Nathaniel Jezzi for stylistic suggestions, as well as Martin Griffiths and Lynette Talbot from Cambridge University Press for their guidance through this project, and Lindsay Nightingale for her superb copy-editing.


Contributors

Professor Fred Adams
Department of Linguistics and Cognitive Science
University of Delaware
Newark, DE 19716
USA

Professor Colin Allen
Department of History and Philosophy of Science
Indiana University
1011 East Third Street
Goodbody Hall 130
Bloomington, IN 47405
USA

Dr Steven M. Beighley
Department of Psychology
University of Delaware
Newark, DE 19716
USA

Dr Carlos A. Botero
Initiative in Biocomplexity and Global Change Center
North Carolina State University
Raleigh, NC 27695
USA

Dr Christison-Lagay
Department of Otorhinolaryngology: Head and Neck Surgery
University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine
Philadelphia, PA 19104
USA
Professor Reginald B. Cocroft
Division of Biological Sciences
University of Missouri
105 Tucker Hall
Columbia, MO 65211
USA

Professor Yale E. Cohen
Department of Otorhinolaryngology: Head and Neck Surgery
University of Pennsylvania School of Medicine
3400 Spruce – 5 Ravdin
Philadelphia, PA 19104
USA

Professor Richard G. Coss
Department of Psychology
University of California
Young Hall, CA 95616
USA

Dr Sasha R. X. Dall
Centre for Ecology and Conservation
Biosciences, College of Life and Environmental Sciences
University of Exeter
Cornwall Campus, Tremough
Penryn
Cornwall TR10 9EZ
UK

Professor Julia Fischer
Cognitive Ethology Laboratory
German Primate Center
Kellnerweg 4
37077 Göttingen
Germany

Professor Peter Godfrey-Smith
Philosophy Program, The Graduate Center, CUNY
365 Fifth Avenue
New York, NY 10016
USA
Professor Claire Horisk  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Missouri  
437 Strickland Hall  
Columbia, MO 65211-4160  
USA

Professor Andrew Horn  
Department of Biology, Life Science Centre  
Dalhousie University  
Halifax, Nova Scotia  
B3H 4J1  
Canada

Dr Caitlin Kight  
Centre for Ecology and Conservation  
School of Biosciences, College of Life and Environmental Sciences  
University of Exeter  
Cornwall Campus, Tremough  
Penryn  
Cornwall TR10 9EZ  
UK

Professor Simon Kirby  
School of Psychology, Philosophy and Language Sciences  
University of Edinburgh  
3 Charles Street  
Edinburgh, EH8 9AD  
UK

Dr Selvino de Kort  
Division of Biology and Conservation Ecology  
School of Science and the Environment  
Manchester Metropolitan University  
Chester Street  
Manchester, M1 5GD  
UK

Dr Michael Lachmann  
Department of Evolutionary Genetics  
Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology
Contributors

Deutscher Platz 6
04103 Leipzig
Germany

Dr Peter McGregor
Reader in Applied Zoology
Cornwall College Newquay
Centre for Applied Zoology
Wildflower Lane
Trenance Gardens
Newquay TR7 2LZ
UK

Professor John M. McNamara
School of Mathematics
University of Bristol
University Walk
Bristol BS8 1TW
UK

Professor Ruth Garrett Millikan
University of Connecticut
Philosophy Department
Storrs, CT 06269-2054
USA
fax: 860-486-0387

Professor Eugene S. Morton
Hemlock Hill Field Station, Cambridge Springs, Pennsylvania
and Department of Biology, York University, Toronto
4700 Keele Street
Toronto, ON
Canada M3J 1P3

Professor Michael J. Owren
Department of Psychology
Emory University
Atlanta, GA 30322
USA

Drew Rendall
Behaviour and Evolution Research Group
Lab of Comparative Communication and Cognition  
Department of Psychology  
University of Lethbridge  
Lethbridge, Alberta T1K 3M4  
Canada

**Professor Michael Ryan**  
Section of Integrative Biology  
University of Texas  
Austin, TX 78712  
USA

**Professor Sahotra Sarkar**  
Department of Philosophy  
and Section of Integrative Biology  
University of Texas  
Waggener Hall 316  
Austin, TX 78712 -1180  
USA

**Professor Andrea Scarantino**  
Department of Philosophy and Neuroscience Institute  
Georgia State University  
PO Box 4089  
Atlanta, GA 30302-4089  
USA

**Dr Thomas C. Scott-Phillips**  
Department of Anthropology  
Durham University  
Dawson Building  
South Road  
Durham, DH1 3LE  
UK

**Professor David M. Stephens**  
Ecology, Evolution, and Behavior  
University of Minnesota  
1987 Upper Buford Circle  
St Paul, MN 55108  
USA
Contributors

Professor R. Haven Wiley
Department of Biology
University of North Carolina
Chapel Hill, NC 27599-3280
USA